



CHRIST CHURCH CATHEDRAL REVITALIZATION Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment

APRIL 5, 2011

REPORT #2 – IMPACT ASSESSMENT

PREPARED FOR:

Windmill Developments in trust

PREPARED BY:

BRAY Heritage

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1	Current Heritage Assessment Policies.....	1
2	Conservation Goals and Objectives.....	3
3	Impact of Proposed Development	7
3.1	Description of Proposed Development and Impact Mitigation Measures.....	7
3.2	Options Considered	11
3.3	Summary of Impact on Cultural Heritage Resources	12
3.4	Conclusion: Rationale for the Chosen Development Option	13
4	Conservation and Development Strategy	15
	Appendix –Excerpts from the Urban Design Brief	

CHRIST CHURCH CATHEDRAL REVITALIZATION

Cultural Heritage Impact Statement

REPORT #2 –IMPACT ASSESSMENT

1 Current Heritage Assessment Policies

The City's heritage inventory and evaluation, as well as similar documentation prepared by Parks Canada/Historic Sites and Monuments Board for 71 Bronson, both are very comprehensive and do not need updating except for minor aspects. For example, our current research has identified the architect for 71 Bronson and corrected minor errors in the chronology of property ownership. Where the documents fall short is in assessing building interiors, assumed to be inaccessible at the time of the survey. District designation does not involve interiors, however, and the Cathedral interior, the only one potentially affected by that property's Part IV designation, was not considered worthy of designation at the time. Our site investigations have confirmed that elements of the building interiors are worthy of preservation in situ, or at least recording and salvage/reuse. These elements would be identified in a Conservation Plan for the Cathedral properties, to be prepared subsequent to this Cultural Heritage Impact Statement.

The Cathedral Hill Heritage Conservation District Plan (By-law # 286-89) comments on the heritage character of the district, an area that includes not only the subject lands but also residential properties not owned by the Church located further east on both sides of Queen Street, as well as the escarpment and park (but not the Lutheran Church properties). As stated in the staff report proposing designation (Department of Planning and Development, July 11, 1989), the primary reason for district designation appears to be that it "is the last remaining block in the commercial core of Centretown that retains and nineteenth-century neighbourhood

character” (p. 4). At the time of the report’s writing, “the remaining houses now surrounding Christ Church create a richly textured tapestry of urban built forms. Some have historical associations with the Anglican church or important Ottawa families, while others represent unique architectural patterns, and eclectic styles characteristic of the period” (ibid, p.4). However, the report goes on to state that “the most prominent of the houses...is the Roper House at 71 Bronson” (ibid, p. 5). It and the Cathedral are the only buildings identified as having significance that is crucial to the heritage character of the district.

In summarizing the conservation objectives for the district, the report concludes by stating that “this late-nineteenth-century urban grouping of heritage buildings, set on an escarpment of natural limestone, creates a transitional gateway to the more intense curtain of twentieth-century highrise development east of Bay and south of Queen that marks Centretown’s skyline from its western approaches....[designation will] encourage its conservation and continued use as a living part of the City for future generations” (ibid. p. 5).

These objectives are reflected in the Central Area Secondary Plan, Section 1.10 Upper Town. The Plan appears to assume that the Cathedral will be retained and identifies Roper House as a landmark to be conserved (1.10.1). Section 1.10.2 is entitled “Enhance Liveability Protect Heritage”, and Section 1.10.3 has a sub-section (b) entitled “Cathedral Hill Conservation” in which objectives for new infill and alterations to heritage buildings are outlined, all of which are to be “sensitive to, and complement [the district’s] special heritage character.” The only indication of what redevelopment might look like comes in the subsequent sub-section (c) in which the subject lands are seen as being part of an area that is “predominantly” low-medium rise and forming a “transitional entrance to the Central Area which respects the heritage character of the Cathedral Hill area.”

2 Conservation Goals and Objectives

The foregoing municipal policy goals and objectives focus on the area's architectural character, with some reference to its historical associations. This is understandable in the context of heritage planning practice at the time the Heritage Conservation District was first being considered (the 1970s) and at the time of its designation (the late 1980s). However, heritage character within the 2005 *Ontario Heritage Act* is considered to be more comprehensive, encompassing both physical/material and associative values. As shown in the assessment of the heritage significance of each building prepared for this report, the historical/associative values of the properties are an important part of their heritage significance, in some cases being as important as their architectural values.

In the context of the proposed development of the Cathedral properties, it is thus necessary to consider both the *physical* and the *associative* values inherent in these sites. Keeping in mind that **the primary purpose of this redevelopment proposal is to permit the ongoing operation of the Cathedral, and to enable the Diocese of Ottawa to continue to serve the Ottawa community from its traditional location, the primary conservation goal becomes the preservation of the Church operations in situ**. Buildings essential to fostering this goal – the Cathedral and Lauder Hall – thus become the primary subjects of conservation activity. New development must also provide a fitting replacement for the functions currently provided by Cathedral Hall. Given the financial situation of the Church now and, it is assumed, in the foreseeable future, the only viable option to conserving the Church and its operation is to redevelop its adjacent lands.

Such redevelopment does not occur in a vacuum, however: the City's heritage goals for the Conservation District as a whole must also be addressed. It is here that the conservation of Roper House in situ becomes an important component of the overall redevelopment scheme. By conserving Roper House and its flanking lawns, the key element in this part of the Conservation District's 19th century streetscape is conserved, and one of the last survivors of the lumber baron era can be kept and interpreted. Since the City's heritage planning objectives identify the landmark function of Roper House, its conservation, along with that of the Cathedral and Lauder Hall, addresses the key elements of the Conservation District Plan and the Secondary Plan.

The Queen Street townhouses are not mentioned specifically in the City's heritage planning policies, nor are Cathedral Hall or the former house at 412 Sparks Street (demolished following a fire). These structures were not evaluated highly in the City's heritage inventory and evaluation.

In the context of the intensity of redevelopment required to fund the preservation of the Church's heritage assets and to foster the Church's ongoing mission in the community, conservation of the Hall and townhouses becomes a lesser priority.

Cathedral Hall is of no heritage significance and its demolition and replacement within a new structure is feasible from a heritage standpoint. Architecturally, the existing Cathedral entrance area, which is part of Cathedral Hall, detracts from Cathedral itself. The new entrance area in the proposed development improves this condition substantially and allows greater sight lines from the north east. As for the Queen Street townhouses, while they are in reasonably good condition and are representative examples of late 19th century middle-class residential construction, they are not unique. Their retention, in whole or in part, would support the pedestrian scale streetscape along the north side of Queen Street and retain another remnant of the late 19th century streetscape valued in the Conservation District. However, compared to the heritage significance of Roper House, the Cathedral and Lauder Hall, the townhouses are clearly of secondary importance.

In summary, the conservation goals and objectives for the Church lands are as follows:

GOAL:

To conserve and enhance the church and its operations in situ

Objectives:

- To conserve the Cathedral and Lauder Hall in situ;
- To conserve Roper House and its flanking lawns in situ;
- To preserve views of the Cathedral spire and façade from the north and along Sparks Street; and,
- To retain a pedestrian-scaled streetscape along Sparks and Queen Streets.

PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT: VIEW FROM THE NORTHWEST



3 Impact of Proposed Development

3.1 DESCRIPTION¹ OF PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT AND IMPACT MITIGATION MEASURES

The proposed development will integrate new construction to compliment the extensive heritage assets on the approximately 2 acre site. New construction consists of an office tower to the east of the Christ Church Cathedral, and a high-rise residential condominium tower with a low-rise, mixed-use extension to the west. This mixed-use building provides residential townhouses with front door address on both Sparks Street and Queen Street, and also accommodates important entry, reception and social functions for the Cathedral. Some of these church functions are presently housed in the building on Sparks Street (Cathedral Hall) that is proposed to be demolished. The reconfiguration of the church's adjunct spaces in the new facility will provide better facilities for the church in a more accessible arrangement. A new Civic Court is established across from the Garden of the Provinces and Territories as the Ceremonial entrance to Christ Church Cathedral. This new space also provides functional address for the Cathedral on its west side. The scheme maintains an existing semi-private garden immediately west of the Cathedral and east of the new Church Hall. In the manner of a traditional cloistered space, the new Cathedral function rooms have visual and physical access to this garden space. Ample natural light permeates the interior space. The site includes several noteworthy historic buildings, including the Cathedral and Lauder Hall, the Lutheran Church, Roper House and two semi-detached houses. Roper House on Bronson Avenue at Sparks Street (the west end of the site) currently houses the office of the Diocese. The new development proposes to keep this function intact. The three 'street facing' sides of Roper house are maintained with future plan to restore it to its original grandeur and landscape.

The 22,676 gross square metres of new building development replaces some existing functions on the site and provides for the following uses:

- 136 Residential condominiums, including street level townhouses on Sparks and Queen Streets
- Office space
- Ecclesiastical and Community spaces.

¹ Description of the proposed development created by HOK Architects as part of the Urban Design Brief for the Site Plan Control process.

The site maintains the unrestricted north-south public access currently enjoyed today. A central courtyard is provided as a site for public art devoted to improved public understanding of the importance of the environment and sustainability issues. A new philosopher's walk is introduced between the cathedral and office tower allowing clear and clean access to the enjoyment of the splendor of the cathedral wall and buttresses.

3.1.1 Heights

The significance of the Christ Church Cathedral Spire establishes the focus and purpose for the development. It also informed us on versatility for design purposes. The mass of the office building to the east of the Cathedral is stepped in deference to the position and prominence of its spire. Additionally the building floor plate steps inward incrementally every few floors towards the top of the tower further accentuating the angle of the spire. The office tower rises beyond the Cathedral spire to a proposed 50 metres at the main roof, (with a mechanical penthouse tower at 54 metres on its east side); the massing is sensitive to the location and prominence of the spire. At 12.7 metre high, the low-rise residential townhouses and residential tower podium is coordinated with and relates to the commercial tower's base. And it is at a height compatible with the Cathedral, Lauder Hall, Roper House as well as the three existing properties toward the east end of Queen Street. The high rise portion of the residential tower is situated a considerable distance west from the Cathedral and is expressed in three distinct parts. The south end of the tower rises to 21 storeys at 73.6 metres above Queen Street. The North tower portion rises to 60 metres in height.

3.1.2 Setbacks

The new residential tower has been located to maximize the development potential of the site, in support of the Church's goals, while attempting to minimize impact on the residential neighbours to the south by reducing the east-west presentation on Queen Street for views to the north. The residential tower is also set back on Queen Street approximately 7.4 metres to be in deference to the south face of Lauder Hall and the houses beyond. Between the new residential tower and the Cathedral, a low-rise, mixed-use building is incorporated which houses Church functions to the east and south and includes a row of townhouses with private street level access on Sparks Street. These townhouses are set back 3.0 to 3.6 metres from Sparks Street. The line of the townhouses continue across the main pedestrian and vehicular access route on Sparks Street and contributes to forming the podium edge of the residential tower on Sparks Street. The setback is maintained at the western most townhouse, toward the junction of Bronson and Sparks Street to allow for a more sympathetic transition to the Roper House. A new accessible (transparent) entry pavilion to the west of the Cathedral forecourt is configured to provide level access to the Cathedral floor, approximately 4.67 metres above grade. This entry pavilion is set back 1.8 metres from the north property line, which is further set back than the existing pavilion on Sparks Street, and is approximately 1.7 metres south of the face of the adjacent

townhouses, providing a separation between the Cathedral's forecourt and the adjacent townhouse units. The office building has a tower element on its east side setting back 3.24 metres from the northeast corner of the property line. A new underground parking access and loading dock is located at the southernmost extension of the office tower on Queen Street, set back 22.56 metres to maintain direct views to the masonry expression of the cathedral transept to its west, and the trio of heritage houses to the east. North of the mid-block, east-west property line the office tower is set back 3.0 metres north (beyond current zoning requirements), adjacent to the heritage houses on Queen Street, in deference to the heritage buildings. No setback is required or provided along the easternmost property line shared with the Lutheran Church.

3.1.3 Access/Egress West Tower:

The main lobby entrance of the residential tower is oriented east and addresses an interior landscaped courtyard situated between Lauder Hall and the low rise development on Sparks Street. The access to this courtyard is intended primarily as a public pedestrian route through the site. Vehicular passage is permitted to traverse the lane, but at the speed of the pedestrian. And to encourage this pattern the surface treatment of the courtyard will be masonry paving units. Vehicular movement is one way southbound from Sparks Street towards Queen Street for passenger drop-off at the residential main lobby, emergency vehicle access and loading. Bicycle racks are provided adjacent the lobby plaza for visitors, and the building is outfitted with interior bike parking for the convenience of residents and to meet the LEED NC requirements. The underground parking garage entrance/egress is located on Queen Street toward the west side of the tower's podium base. And loading is located along on the north-south vehicular access route described above with side door access to the tower. This minimizes the use of streetscape dedicated to building servicing. East Commercial Tower: The front entrance of the east office tower has its address on Sparks Street. The main pedestrian entry is located on the east side of the building and party to the forecourt of the Cathedral. A paved north-south meandering parallels the west side of the tower, acknowledging and reinforcing current public access through the site. This pathway is well lit to encourage safe pedestrian use day and night. Bicycle racks are provided adjacent the lobby plaza for visitors and the building is outfitted with bike parking and showers for the convenience of building occupants and also to meet the LEED NC requirements. The underground parking entrance/egress is on Queen Street providing appropriate separation between the main vehicular and pedestrian entries. The loading dock is located on the north side of Queen Street and is set back considerably from the sidewalk to allow the historic buildings on either side to appropriately form the streetscape view from both the east and west vantage points.

3.1.4 Deference to Heritage Assets:

The office tower provides a uniform calm background 'foil' which highlights the spire and restores the Cathedral's prominence on the Ottawa skyline. The podium provides a compatible relationship with the heritage assets in terms of height and material selection, and maintains the scale of the building fabric of the site, especially when seen from the pedestrian perspective at sidewalk level. Masonry module and finish: The material proposed for the podium level of both the residential and the office tower is a stone similar in colour to that of the existing historic buildings on the site. The texture of the stone would be a smooth finish to distinguish it from the rusticated stone of the Cathedral and the Lutheran Church to the east of the site. The masonry module of the residential tower would mediate between the scale of stone finish on the Cathedral and Lauder Hall and the brick finish of Roper House to the west. The site is located on a limestone outcrop and we will incorporate excavation materials into the project.

3.1.5 Sustainability:

Cathedral Hill will embody sustainability by providing a legible narrative of environmental stewardship to the neighbourhood, City of Ottawa and the National Capital Region. The proposed development will articulate sustainability in the realm of quantitative performance and conservation of natural resources such as energy, water, waste, materials, esthetic of building architecture and also in context of the site, relationship to adjacent built and natural environments and respect of the Heritage Significance of the Christ Church Cathedral lands. Cathedral Hill will demonstrate inclusiveness and integration of sustainability in support of the City of Ottawa as a leader in placing value on natural capital in the national capital.

The buildings will be designed to LEED Platinum, and marketed as LEED Gold. Please note that all of Windmill Development's past projects have been awarded LEED² Platinum, including the highest scoring LEED project in the world at Docksider Green in Victoria. The development will comply with all expectations of the Green Building Checklist, with a special emphasis on ensuring storm water discharge rates are maintained at or below existing conditions through a variety of measures including cisterns and green roofs.

The Cathedral Hill development will demonstrate and embrace tenets of environmental stewardship, foster awareness and social benefits of green development and demonstrate the economic viability of green development in the City of Ottawa.

² Leadership in Energy and Environmental Design for New Construction and Major Renovations (LEED® Canada NC) 2009 CaGBC

3.2 OPTIONS CONSIDERED

The proposed conservation and development approach is the result of a consultation process involving the development team and City staff. From the beginning of the project, it was apparent that heritage considerations were paramount and that new development would have to be compatible with the significant heritage resources found on the subject lands and located within the existing Heritage Conservation District.

The chosen option emerged from this iterative process. Tradeoffs were made continuously throughout the process, with the design team responding to the City's evolving requirements, which became more specific as the design became more refined. The design team not only conducted an extensive review of design options within the architectural team, but it also presented the evolving design to the City's OBHAC and Urban Design Review Panel at a pre-consultation stage, in order to elicit comments early in the design development phase. For a summary of the options considered, please see Appendix B.

Throughout the design process, the project heritage consultant worked closely with the City's heritage planners to ensure that their concerns and comments were accurately reflected in the design team's responses and that the proposed design followed conservation best practices as well as addressed municipal requirements for Cultural Heritage Impact Statements. New research into the history of the site prepared for this proposal also provided key design cues, including archival information on the probable landscape treatment of Roper House and the original land uses and streetscape character of the Conservation District.

From the outset, the primary goal of conserving the ongoing functions of the church on this site drove the design process. Alongside this goal were the key City objectives of conserving the heritage character of the Heritage Conservation District. The design team and the City determined that retaining Roper House in situ, with its related landscape, was essential, as were design responses that ensured that the Cathedral and Lauder Hall remained prominent elements of the west downtown landscape.

While it was recommended by the City early on that the massing envelope for the proposed development would include two towers on a podium base, and entail the removal of Cathedral Hall, the response to the Queen Street townhouses was the subject of lengthy discussion. The chosen response was a compromise between the proponent's wish to remove the structures entirely and the City's wish to retain the existing townhouses in situ.

3.3 SUMMARY OF IMPACT ON CULTURAL HERITAGE RESOURCES

ADVANTAGES OF THE PROPOSED DESIGN

Roper House and its front and side lawns will remain in situ and be preserved. The house foundation will be repaired and it is anticipated that it will remain in its current use as Diocesan offices and rental apartments. Roper House will remain as a landmark on the western edge of the escarpment that marks the transition into the downtown core, a key heritage objective identified in the Cathedral Hill Heritage Conservation District Plan.

Lauder Hall and the Cathedral will remain in situ and be preserved. The non-heritage Cathedral Hall will be demolished and replaced with new church-related uses and residential townhouses that better reinforce the pedestrian scale of the Sparks Street streetscape. Important views of the landmark Cathedral spire will be retained.

The Queen Street townhouses will be conserved in part. The front portion of the townhouses, including the front wall and portions of the side walls and roof, will be retained and integrated within the new townhouses proposed for this part of the residential tower podium base.

DISADVANTAGES OF THE PROPOSED DESIGN

The new towers will be slightly higher than the Cathedral spire and considerably higher than the other existing heritage buildings on the subject lands. Roper House will be seen against the backdrop of a tall building, albeit with a neutral podium base in the background.

Only portions of the Queen Street townhouses will be retained and the conserved portion will have to be secured and moved to another part of the subject lands during construction of the underground parking, then moved back and integrated within new residential construction. This approach is clearly less desirable than retention of the existing structures in situ, in whole or in part.

3.4 CONCLUSION: RATIONALE FOR THE CHOSEN DEVELOPMENT OPTION

The redevelopment necessary to meet the Church's financial and operational requirements results in buildings that are of an imposing scale. Certainly it would be preferable to keep their massing at the residential scale of Roper House and Lauder Hall, for example, but this is clearly not possible if the Church is to remain a viable community asset. The new buildings meet the conservation goal and objectives listed in Section 2, above. By replacing and enhancing the Church-related uses now found in Cathedral Hall, they support the Church's ongoing operations. By providing parking within new development, they meet the Church's parking and access requirements and remove unsightly surface parking lots. By preserving important sight lines, they allow the Cathedral and Roper House to remain as area landmarks. By providing both residential and office uses, the new buildings support the revitalization of this part of Upper Town, as envisaged in the Secondary Plan, and continue the residential land uses that have traditionally characterized this neighbourhood.

Despite the size and intensity of the proposed development, the new buildings do not directly impact the key heritage buildings on the Church lands. By being physically separate from the existing buildings, though possible to be linked for access purposes, the new structures allow the existing heritage buildings to retain their heritage fabric intact. Should at some time in the distant future the proposed buildings be removed, then this "reversible intervention" still leaves the key heritage buildings in place for the use and enjoyment of future generations. And by conserving existing buildings in situ, as well as achieving the highest sustainability objectives for "green" construction, the proposed development meets the broader heritage goals of energy conservation and adaptive reuse.

In summary, although the proposed new buildings are clearly much larger than the existing heritage buildings, their impact is mitigated by several design measures. A podium base on the residential tower matches the height of Roper House and Lauder Hall and is also shifted west as far as possible from the Cathedral so as not to compete with the heritage church. The eastern building also respects the Cathedral's landmark status by stepping back at key datum points on its façade to retain views of the architectural features of the Cathedral spire. In both cases, the new towers have been designed with small footprints and very strong vertical lines in order to accentuate and compliment the verticality of the Cathedral spire. Providing street-related residential uses along Queen Street respects the character of the residential streetscape and continues the existing land use. By providing sufficient density on the site, the Church will earn lease payments that ensure ongoing revenue to cover the maintenance costs for the Heritage assets on the site, ensuring their preservation for future generations. These design responses address both the physical and associative heritage values of the Cathedral Hill Heritage Conservation District.

4 Conservation and Development Strategy

The foregoing discussion outlines the design process that resulted in the proposed development. Conservation measures were described and mitigative responses outlined. The following is a summary of the components of the heritage permit application that are proposed to conserve and enhance the site's cultural heritage resources. The following are the recommended conservation strategies for the properties within the Church lands:

- **Cathedral:** preservation of the exterior and preservation of a small portion of the west exterior wall within an expanded Cathedral lobby (details of interior conservation to be found in the Conservation Plan); continued use for church functions;
- **Lauder Hall:** preservation of the exterior (details of interior conservation to be found in the Conservation Plan); continued use for church functions;
- **Roper House:** preservation of the exterior, retention of the house and side lawns in situ (with some additional landscape treatment to address service access and parking and private outdoors space for an adjacent residential unit), repair of the existing foundation; *optional restoration of the former verandah and landscape treatment of the front and side lawns (based on documentary evidence)*; details of interior conservation to be found in the Conservation Plan); adaptive re-use or continued use for Diocesan offices/rental apartments;
- **441-443 Queen Street:** retention of the front wall, reconstruction of the street-facing components of the porches and roof (re-installing the existing dormers), retention of portions of the side walls (front wall and portions of side walls attached to a frame and moved off site during construction, as described in the attached report); and
- **Cathedral Hall:** demolition and salvage of any exterior and interior elements (to be identified in the Conservation Plan), for potential re-use within the new development.

Mitigation strategies for lessening the impact of new construction include:

- Design of a podium base for each building that is compatible in scale and function with the adjacent heritage buildings;
- Application of exterior materials that provide a compatible visual backdrop to the heritage buildings;
- Location of service and parking access, as well as exterior HVAC services, in areas that are not directly adjacent to the heritage buildings; and,

- For the adjacent Queen Anne Revival residential properties at Nos. 407, 409 and 411 Queen Street, all rated Group 2 and contained within the Heritage Conservation District, the podium base of the proposed office building is designed with massing, materials and setbacks so as to provide a compatible backdrop to these houses (further details of mitigation measures to be contained in the Conservation Plan).

Additional studies to accompany the proposed development:

- Conservation plan for Roper House, the Cathedral and Lauder Hall (to be prepared by a heritage architect, in consultation with the team heritage consultant)
- Additional details for the conservation, relocation and re-installation of the Queen Street townhouses

Appendix – Excerpts from the Urban Design Brief

NOTE: FoTenn Planning and HOK Architecture prepared the contents of this appendix as portions of the Urban Design Brief that accompanied the Site Plan Control submission for the proposed development.

Appendix B – Massing and Design Options Considered

NOTE: HOK Architecture prepared the contents of this appendix as a submission to the the Urban Design Review Panel for the proposed development.